

Manure Treatment Technologies Expert Panel: Revisions and next steps

Doug Hamilton, PhD, MTT Panel Chair, Oklahoma State

Jeremy Hanson, Panel Coordinator, Virginia Tech

Recap

- March 31: MTT panel report distributed
- April 14: Webinar presenting panel's recommendations
- April 21: Agriculture Workgroup
- May 3: Initial 30-day comment period ended (COB)
- May 19: Agriculture Workgroup
- July 8: Email with written response-to-comments documents sent to those who submitted comments
- July 20: Agriculture Workgroup

Panel report materials are available online (April 14 webinar page):

<http://www.chesapeakebay.net/calendar/event/23875/>

Recap of comments

- Comments received from over a dozen partners or interested parties
 - Three state partners (VA DEQ, VA DCR, PA DEP, MDE, MDA, MD DNR) plus the Chesapeake Bay Commission
 - Non-profit and for-profit organizations, including:
 - Chesapeake Bay Foundation
 - Sustainable Chesapeake
 - Aqua Terra
 - EnviroKure
 - Coaltec
 - CleanBay

Recap: recurring themes and issues raised

- The majority of comments covered general or specific aspects of the following non-mutually-exclusive topics:
 - Air emissions and air deposition (NO_x and Ammonia)
 - Non-treatment fate of nutrients (storage/handling, field application, etc.)
 - Tracking and Reporting
 - Modeling
 - Trading
- Comments were also provided on other miscellaneous topics
 - Edits to text/graphics
 - Questions about NVE, NSE, PSE calculations

Revisions and updates

- Three documents provided to respond to comments and describe or explain revisions:
 - Summary memo
 - Full report (with track-changes)
 - Table of all comments, with responses
- Those materials have complete details, we'll highlight the biggest updates here.

Air emissions for TCC and Composting

- Thermochemical: For Combustion, available data suggests 90% of the nitrogen released to the air is N_2 ; the remaining 10% is reactive, primarily as NO_x and some ammonia. For gasification it is 96% as N_2 , 4% reactive. No data for pyrolysis but the operating conditions make it reasonable to apply the same assumptions as gasification. See text added to pages 32-33 of track-changes version of report.
- Composting systems: Essentially all N emissions are in ammonia form (less than 6% as N_2O). See pages 47-50 of track-changes version of report.
- Forthcoming decision from Modeling Workgroup will be applied to these reactive portions of N emissions and the values in Table ES.1 in the Executive Summary and Table A.2 in the Technical Appendix will be updated to reflect the adjusted values for P6 modeling purposes. The values and tables in the TCC and Composting chapters will remain unchanged to reflect the panel's assessment of TN that remains in the treated manure in the real world.

Other notable changes to report

- Modified Figure B.2 (page 10) and added clarifying language
- Chapter 10 revised based on comments
- Chapters 11 and 12 were posted shortly after report was distributed on March 31st; they have been added to the rest of the report so they are no longer separate files.
- Various other clarifying edits or corrections throughout the report, as described in Summary Memo or the Table of comments and responses, and shown in the track-changes version of the report.

Next steps

- Request for AgWG approval today to move panel's recommendations to the WTWG. Some updates to Appendix A expected to reflect comments so far and WTWG feedback.

MTT panel report

- Today: AgWG approval
- Aug or Sep: WTWG approval
- Sep or Oct: Seek WQGIT approval

Modeling WG

- Aug Quarterly: Discuss and decide on how to account for N volatilization and redeposition in P6
- Updates to Tables ES.1 and A.2 based on Modeling WG decision

Policy Group

- Timeline and membership TBD

We request that...

...the Agriculture Workgroup consider approval of the panel's technical recommendations for submission to the Watershed Technical Workgroup with the understanding that the policy group process and the Modeling Workgroup decision will clarify the panel's recommendations in the context of the overall Phase 6 Modeling Suite and for water quality trading programs (i.e. how to account for effects that occur outside the "black box" of manure treatment described by the panel in accordance with their scope), but that the outcome of the policy group process and the decision of the Modeling Workgroup do not change the panel's technical assessment of the total nitrogen and total phosphorus that leaves the "black box" and remains available for field application or transport in the modeling tools.

Thank you!

The April 14 webinar page will remain the “one-stop shop” for the report and other materials during the review process:

<http://www.chesapeakebay.net/calendar/event/23875/>

Contact Jeremy with any questions or comments

jchanson@vt.edu

410-267-5753